

Quebec Cree Agreement and the Wuskwatim SOU

“Like trying to compare a muskrat to a caribou herd.”

Throughout the four-month-long Clean Environment Commission (CEC) hearing, opponents of the Wuskwatim project unfavourably compared the *Summary of Understandings* (SOU) between Manitoba Hydro and Nisichawayasihk Cree Nation with the *2002 Peace of the Braves Agreement*, between the Province of Quebec and nine Cree nations.

THE TWO AGREEMENTS ARE SIGNIFICANTLY DIFFERENT

- The Quebec agreement is effectively a treaty, while the SOU is a proposal for a business partnership.
- The SOU sets out the understandings between a utility, (Manitoba Hydro), and a single First Nation (NCN) for a limited partnership arrangement in respect to a single hydroelectric development project - Wuskwatim.
- The Quebec agreement on the other hand is a comprehensive economic and social/cultural agreement between a provincial government and a governing authority for the Crees of Quebec (Nine First Nations).
- The Quebec agreement modifies an existing Treaty. It provides for a transfer of funds so the James Bay Cree can assume certain obligations with respect to community and economic development, including, for example, fire protection, training, local entrepreneurial support and other community affairs services.

THE ULTIMATE SCOPE AND SCALE OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT OF THE QUEBEC PROJECTS WILL BE FAR GREATER THAN THE LOW IMPACT OF THE WUSKWATIM PROJECT

- The Quebec agreement deals with all resource development in the area, including forestry, mining and hydroelectric development. While it talks generally about two large new hydro projects that will involve significant flooding, (the Eastmain 1 and Eastmain 1-A/Rupert projects) it is not intended to establish how the projects will be constructed or managed.

The table on the back highlights the main differences between the two agreements. (over)



Quebec Cree Agreement compared with Wuskwatim's SOU

	Peace of the Braves Agreement	Wuskwatim Summary of Understandings
Nature of Agreement	Effectively a treaty (nation-to-nation agreement between the province of Quebec and the Grand Council of the Crees)	A business proposal to enter into a partnership to build Wuskwatim (Between Manitoba Hydro and Nisichawayasihk Cree Nation)
Number of Cree Nations Involved	Nine	One
Populations of Communities Involved as of 2001	13,530	4,547
Alteration of First Nation Government Structures	Structural changes may result as community and economic development services plans are developed	No change
Impacts on Zoning and Treaty Land Entitlement	Alters the way forestry resources are developed	No impact
Equity Opportunity	None	Up to 33 per cent of a limited partnership
Terms of Cash Flows	50 years	Life of the project: minimum of 67 years, probably 100 years with refurbishments
Risk Related to Cash Flows	No investment risk, because they have no investment in a particular project	NCN has an investment risk, but protection is provided for NCN's initial cash investment
Responsibilities of Aboriginal Communities for Third Party Liabilities	None	None
Number of Dams	Five	One
Power Capacity	Total of two projects: 1250 MW	200 MW
Flooded Area	833 square kilometres	Less than 0.5 square kilometres
In-service Dates	Eastmain 1 Project: 2007 Eastmain 1-ARupert Project: 2010	About 2010
Total Construction Costs	\$4 billion	\$710.12 million at 2002 values
Number of Jobs Expected to be Created	10,500 person-years over nine years	1,109 person-years over six years
Jobs for Aboriginal People	No guarantee of jobs	Projected (not guaranteed) jobs for NCN Members: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 81 to 93 (first two years) • 80 to 113 (last four years) Other northern Manitoba Aboriginals: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 53 to 65 (first two years) • 181 to 256 (last four years)
Training Centre	Addressed in a separate document, not available for public viewing	Atoskiwin Training and Employment Centre
Training Funding	Addressed in a separate document, not available for public viewing	Manitoba Hydro has allocated up to \$5 million for pre-project training

This is a summary of the *Response to the Manitoba Clean Environment Commission's Request for a Comparison of Agreement Concerning a New Relationship, 2002, Between the Government of Quebec and the Crees of Quebec and Wuskwatim Project Summary of Understandings 2003, Between Nisichawayasihk Cree Nation and Manitoba Hydro*, prepared for the CEC. If there are discrepancies between this and the full report, the full report will prevail.

The full report has been submitted to the Manitoba Clean Environment Commission by Manitoba Hydro and Nisichawayasihk Cree Nation.